

Citizenship Awareness Appraisal in Mohmand District: Shaping Post-Merger Development in Former FATA

ALAMZEB AAMIR

Principle Investigator – HEC NRPU Research Project
Assistant Professor – Department of Management Sciences FATA University.
Email: alamzeb.aamir@fu.edu.pk

SHARIF ULLAH JAN

Co-Principal Investigator - HEC NRPU Research Project
Lecturer – Department of Management Sciences FATA University.
Email: sharifullah.jan@fu.edu.pk

MOUDASSIR HABIB

Co-Principal Investigator - HEC NRPU Research Project
Lecturer – Department of Management Sciences FATA University.
Email: m.habib@fu.edu.pk

ALLAH YAR

Research Assistant - HEC NRPU Research Project
Lecturer- Higher Education Department Kp.
Email: aallahyar96@gmail.com

Abstract

This research paper investigates the participatory action needs-based assessment process in the newly merged district of Mohmand, Erstwhile FATA, with a focus on citizenship awareness and knowledge. A questionnaire was developed, and a survey was conducted involving 220 participants. Additionally, four focus group events were organized, engaging 84 participants to identify common needs and plan actions. Citizenship awareness and community development emerged as significant concerns, leading to action planning. The study highlights the effectiveness of participatory action research in mobilizing individuals on citizenship awareness. Common concerns in the locality include water, electricity, education, and communication infrastructure, while strengths lie in healthcare and government schooling. The research underscores the low citizenship awareness and knowledge levels in the region. Demographically, awareness varies based on family income, and knowledge varies with gender, education, and family income. The paper strongly recommends prioritizing basic facilities and equal treatment for Mohmand district residents to foster citizenship awareness and ensure equitable access to benefits and rights in line with national citizenship standards. In order to address the identified gaps in citizenship awareness and knowledge in other newly merged districts like Mohmand, it is important to go deeper into the specific tactics and interventions. For policymakers and practitioners, it would be beneficial to investigate the long-term effects of greater access to basic services on civic consciousness and participation.

Keywords: *Citizenship Awareness, Knowledge level, Participatory Action, District Mohmand.*

Introduction

Throughout history, the erstwhile FATA has been remained a region of interest for the world powers (Khan, 2011). This interest has mainly centered on the exploitation of its geography to leverage political gains. An autocratic political order in the shape of Frontier Crime Regulation (FCR), constant warfare for

the last five decades, and little to no attention to the welfare of the people has reduced the chances of human development in the region be it social, political, or cultural. However, as the figures suggest, education seems to be the most fatal casualty of these wars. With a literacy rate of only 7.5% for women and 45% for men in erstwhile FATA, the access to education is not matched by its quality and thus a vacuum of aware citizenship is the result.

Comparing FATA's political growth to that of other regions of the nation, a very different picture emerges. No democratic elected government was able to protect the basic political rights of the people of FATA for a long time. Their right to expression, association, and participation in political activities was suppressed till 2018. They could not openly express themselves due to the fear of losing life and being sent behind bars. As a matter of fact, due to suppressive measures on behalf of the political authorities across the tribal belt, expressing feelings and pinpointing faults in the acts of the ruling class was not less than digging graves for themselves. Freedom of expression was, however, not considered as a basic human right and that is why the people of FATA had to choose either the devil or the deep sea (Burki, 2012). Before the introduction of the adult franchise in FATA in 1996, only Maliks were given the authority to cast their votes on behalf of the entire population of these areas even though they never enjoyed genuine support among the common people across FATA (Kerr, 2010). Under a limited franchise-based system the Maliks and selected notables, however, enjoyed the right to vote till then but the common masses of those areas were deprived of such rights (Shah, 2012).

Literature Review

The second decade of the twenty-first century witnessed the initiative of electoral reforms in FATA. The federal government chalked out a major program of electoral reforms and development in FATA as part of its strategy to blunt the appeal for militancy, extremism, and fundamentalism by allowing greater political activities through key changes in the relatively hard federal law i.e. the Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR) and initiating mega development schemes in 2011, (Nawa-i-Waqt, and 13th August 2011). Hence, the people of erstwhile FATA who had been in the dark about the concept of citizenship, democratic rights, duties, and other important factors are in dire need of education and training on the above-mentioned themes.

Citizenship is defined as, the condition of being vested with the rights, duties, and responsibilities of a member of a state or nation. According to Fogelman, "Citizenship is about who we are, how we live together, and what kind of people we want to develop as our future generations. Citizenship education comprises three essential components, as outlined by Fogelman (2001): political literacy, social and moral responsibility, and community involvement. To comprehend the essence of citizenship, young individuals must grasp their roles and positions within the global context and acquire the skills necessary for active participation in society at local, national, and international levels, as emphasized by Crick (1998).

Historically, FATA has been regarded as a semi-autonomous region; however, contemporary times necessitate a shift in the government's approach to give due attention to these previously neglected areas. It is imperative that the residents of these regions, as fellow citizens of the same state, receive equal treatment and gain access to comprehensive knowledge about their rights and privileges, which are on par with the rest of the population. In pursuit of this goal, the extension of the Political Parties Order to these areas, as highlighted by Noor (2011), aims to engage tribal people in mainstream party politics, aligning their political participation with that of the broader country.

In any region worldwide, the imperative need to educate individuals about their democratic rights holds particular significance, especially in areas that have long grappled with extremism and violence. In today's context of citizenship, individuals must not only possess knowledge of public issues but also the capacity to collaboratively address them, as highlighted by Morse (1989). This urgency for civic education becomes even more pronounced in light of the historic constitutional and legislative changes initiated by the federal

government on 2 March 2017, leading to the merger of the tribal areas with Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The intricacies and challenges accompanying this merger revolve around the rehabilitation, reorganization, and reconstruction of these regions. Equally crucial is the empowerment of the youth through education on their democratic rights as citizens of Pakistan and their responsibilities as global citizens.

Research Objectives

This research study has the following main objectives;

1. To aware the people of district Mohmand about their democratic rights as citizens of Pakistan, and their responsibilities as global citizens.
2. To educate the people of district Mohmand to know their democratic rights as citizens of Pakistan and their responsibilities as global citizens.

Methodology

The authors proposed the participatory action research (PAR) needs assessment methodology, to identify the district Mohmand community needs and to promote action. The PAR approach is a self-help and self-reliance-promoted approach that gained recognition as an effective research approach in social sciences (Selener, 1997). The PAR approach encourages the active participation of participants in the identification of their common issues search solutions and take actions for the identified issues to resolve and improve their social conditions (Balcazar, Keys, Kaplan, & Suarez-Balcazar, 1998).

Data Analysis

By using the PAR approach during the focus group discussion the issue and need of common concerns of citizenship awareness has been noted. To resolve the issue and identify possible solutions for the common issue after the focus group discussion a questionnaires have been developed and applied in both English and Pushto language. The questionnaire comprises two parts the demographics and availability of basic resources and the other part comprises two domains assessing awareness and knowledge of participants about citizenship. We measured the participant's awareness and knowledge level by using a three-point Likert measurement scale 1–3. All the participants participated in the study voluntarily and data has been compiled in SPSS.

We used both parametric and non-parametric statistical approaches to analyze the collected sample data from district Mohmand. The items were measured on a scale of 1–3 scale and formed continuous variables by transformation approaches (Maydeu-Olivares, 2005). To accomplish the developed objectives of the study after the basic exploration of data, concerns, and strengths of the facilities we escorted reliability analysis overall and section-wise based on Cronbach's Alpha. After achieving the reliability of data exploratory factor analysis (EFA) was used to discover the most effective latent measuring participant's awareness level (AL) and knowledge level (KL). Furthermore, we used a nonparametric Chi-Square test (McHugh, 2013) to determine the influence of demographics on participants' awareness and knowledge level.

Hypotheses

1. The people of district Mohmand are aware of their democratic rights as citizens of Pakistan, and their responsibilities as global citizens.
2. The people of district Mohmand know their democratic rights as citizens of Pakistan and their responsibilities as global citizens.

Participants’ demographic characteristics

A total of 220 people participants participated in the survey and the following table 1 summarizes the demographic characteristics of the participants. 78.6% of participants were male and 21.4% were female from different age groups ranging from less than 25 years to 65+ years of age, with a maximum of 24.1% from 56 to 65 years and a minimum of 10.5% from 36 to 45 years. A maximum of 44.1% have a primary-middle educational level and a minimum of 0.9% have technical education. A total of 85% of participant’s family income more than 50k and 15% less than 50k.

Table 1: Demographic characteristics of the participants

		N	%
Gender	Male	173	78.6
	Female	47	21.4
Age group	Less than 25 years	28	12.7
	26 to 35	23	10.5
	36 to 45	25	11.4
	46 to 55	47	21.4
	56 to 65	53	24.1
	65+	44	20.0
Education level	Primary-Middle	97	44.1
	Matric-Intermediate	51	23.2
	Bachelor-Master	13	5.9
	Technical	2	.9
	Other	57	25.9
Family income	Less than 25k	12	5.5
	26k to 50k	22	10.0
	51k to 75K	116	52.7
	76k to 100k	33	15.0
	Above 100k	37	16.8
Total		220	100.0

Basics facilities availability, importance, and satisfaction

Table 2 provides an explanation of basic facilities available in the participant’s localities, their importance in the participant’s perception, and the participant’s satisfaction with the available facilities. The importance of facilities and satisfaction with the available facilities are presented as the concern and strength of the locality.

The facility rated high in importance from participants and low in satisfaction classified as concern and the facility rated high in satisfaction as well as high in importance from participants classified as strengths. Regarding the facilities availability, 59.1% of participants declared government hospital/BHU, 64.5% government school, 27.3% government college/university, 30% water, 39.1% electricity, and 34.1% declared telephone/interment facilities are available in their locality.

The most common concerns (less than 50% satisfaction) of the locality noted water with a satisfaction level of 35.10%, government college/university with 41.55% satisfaction level, electricity with a 43.17% satisfaction level, and telephone/interment with 43.47% satisfaction level. The strengths of the locality noted (more than 50% importance and satisfaction) government hospital/BHU and government school.

Table 2: Basics facilities availability, importance, and satisfaction

		N	%	% level of Importance	% level of Satisfaction
Govt.	Yes	130	59.1	96.82%	55.32%
Hospital/BHU	No	90	40.9		
Govt. School	Yes	142	64.5	92.11%	65.25%
	No	78	35.5		
Govt. College/Uni	Yes	60	27.3	89.91%	41.55%
	No	160	72.7		
Water	Yes	66	30.0	100.00%	35.10%
	No	154	70.0		
Electricity	Yes	86	39.1	95.22%	43.17%
	No	134	60.9		
Telephone/Interment	Yes	75	34.1	75.72%	43.47%
	No	145	65.9		
Total		220	100.0		

Reliability Analysis

Table 3 shows the results of the reliability statistic Cronbach’s Alpha for the district Mohmand youth awareness and knowledge about citizenship. The overall reliability for the dataset is noted as 0.743 with no of item 26 and section-wise it is noted for awareness level (AL) 0.817 with no of item 7 and knowledge level (KL) 0.956 with no of item 9. These estimated values of Cronbach’s Alpha statistic confirm the collected sample data reliability.

Table 3: The results of reliability analysis for the district Mohmand data

Data	Cronbach’s Alpha	No. of items
Overall	0.743	26
AL	0.817	7
KL	0.956	9

Exploratory Factor Analysis

From the exploratory factor analysis, we noted that a total of 71.604% variation was explained by the two latent. The factor loading noted above form the critical threshold value of 0.500 illustrating there is no problem with any of the listed item.

Table 4: The results of exploratory factor analysis

Awareness and knowledge level of the participants	Factor loading	
	AL	KL
After the merger of FATA into Khyber Pakhtunkhwa the formulated rights written in the constitution of Pakistan are now extended to the people of former FATA. Are you aware of these fundamental rights to which under FCR, the people of FATA were not entitle	0.517	
Article 16 give its citizen the right to assemble, call Jirga, meeting of people to solve the issue at hand. Are you aware that, the Constitution is supporting you in your endeavors to resolve your issues?	0.786	
Human beings form associations and organizations for the betterment of their security. Article 15 of the constitution of Pakistan provide its citizen this right of formation of association. Are you aware of this?	0.757	

Article 10 of the constitution of Pakistan slavery and forced labor are prohibited. Are you aware the police and Army in your area have not forced person/persons to do some job forcefully for them?	0.719
Are you aware of the right to safeguard against arbitrary arrest and detention provided in Article 10 of the Constitution?	0.518
Are you aware that, the concerned authorities should inform the arrested person of the grounds/reasons due to which they have/ are going to arrest detached him (Article 10)?	0.784
Are you aware of the avenues and means to adopt if a state institution indulges in widespread human rights violations?	0.746
Do you know that citizen enjoys certain non-violable rights such as the right to life?	0.913
Do you know that citizen claims rights over the state?	0.914
Do you know that the modern state's only aim is to benefit citizens?	0.914
Do you know the state have accepted citizen right to life dignity and inviolability of privacy of home, room, mobile, etc. (Article 14)	0.905
Do you know police Army or any other group of individuals violate your right to assemble as described in Article 16 of the constitution?	0.807
Do you know the constitution has prohibited discrimination based on gender, language, caste, religion province, etc.?	0.905
Do you know the state of Pakistan is obliged to provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of 5 to 16 years?	0.871
Do you know the directive principles of the state (Article 29-40) certain additional rights to Pakistan citizens?	0.783
Do you know the existence of the United Nations (UN) Human Rights Charter 1948?	0.765

Table 5 shows the significant difference in the awareness level latent constraint based on family income and no significant differences were noted based on gender, age group, and educational level of the participants. While in the knowledge level latent constraint, significant differences were noted based on gender, educational level, and family income no significant differences were noted based on the age group of the participants.

Table 5: Differences in awareness and knowledge level latent constraints based on demographic

Latent	Factors	Chi-square	P-value	Decision
AL	Gender	23.228	0.057	Insignificant
	Age group	61.786	0.747	Insignificant
	Educational level	69.419	0.107	Insignificant
	Family income	81.983	0.013	Significant
KL	Gender	26.403	0.023	Significant
	Age group	61.246	0.763	Insignificant
	Educational level	109.722	0.000	Significant
	Family income	193.591	0.000	Significant

Discussion and Conclusion

In the study, we found that, overall, the awareness and knowledge level of citizenship of the Ex-FATA region district Mohmand people are very low. Even in the 21st century, the community is still looking for

the basic facilities water, electricity, college/university, and telephone/interment. How one can assume the awareness and knowledge level of citizenship, their awareness and knowledge level about the rights written in different articles in the constitution of Pakistan? In the very first we need to treat them equally like the citizens of other regions that are enjoying the basic facilities as we all the rule of law and other benefits of being citizens of Pakistan. Furthermore, in connection with the demographic factors we found that significant differences were noted in awareness level based on family income and in the knowledge level based on gender, educational level, and family income. This shows the disparity between rich and poor, the disparity between male and female, and resource distribution within the jurisdiction of district Mohmand. Due to certain limitations the study is limited to only one district of Ex-FATA it is recommended to carry out a study involving all the districts of Ex-FATA. Further to include more people from the villages of the Ex-FATA will also bring more interesting results. In future studies it is recommended to address the identified gaps in citizenship awareness and knowledge in other newly merged districts like Mohmand, it is important to go deeper into the specific tactics and interventions. For policymakers and practitioners, it would be beneficial to investigate the long-term effects of greater access to basic services on civic consciousness and participation.

Limitation

This research work is not without certain limitations. Limited sample size due to limited interest in participation in the study. Limited voice of female participants due to the cultural influence. In addition to this limited questionnaire, the size was due to the lack of the constitution and articles of the constitution limiting more insights into participants' perceptions. Considering these all in the future research studies further explore influential determinants.

References

- Balcazar, F., Keys, C., Kaplan, M. A., & Suarez-Balcazar, Y. (1998). Participatory action research and people with disabilities: Principles and challenges. *Canadian Journal of Rehabilitation*, 12, 105-112.
- Burki, Khan Zeb, (2012). Assessing Democracy in FATA. *Pakistan Observer*, 16 September.
- Fogelman, K. (2001). Education for democratic citizenship in schools, in education, Autonomy, and democratic citizenship: philosophy on changing world. London: Taylor and Frances.
- Kerr, B. R. (2010). *A Progressive Understanding of Pukhtun Social Structures amidst Current Conflict*. Pakistan Institute for Peace Studies Islamabad.
- Khan, A. (2011). FATA: Voice of unheard path dependency and history matters. *Strategic Studies*, 30(1/2), 40-74.
- Maydeu-Olivares, A. Further Empirical Results on Parametric Versus Non-Parametric IRT Modeling of Likert-Type Personality Data. *Multivar. Behav. Res.* 2005, 40, 261-279.
- McHugh M. L. (2013). The chi-square test of independence. *Biochemia Medica*, 23(2), 143-149.
- Morse, Suzanne W. (1989). Renewing Civic Capacity: Preparing College Students for Service and Citizenship. *ERIC Digest*
- Noor, M.Z (2011). FATA Islahaat: Jamhoori Tukhfa. Daily Ausaf, Islamabad, 16 August
- Selener, D. (1997). Participatory action research and social change. New York: Cornell Participatory Action Research Network.
- Shah, S.W (2012). Political Reforms in Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA): Will It End the Current Militancy? *Heidelberg Paper in South Asian and Comparative Politics, Working Paper No. 64*.

Appendix (1)

Awareness level	Yes	No	Don't know
After the merger of FATA into Khyber Pakhtunkhwa the formulated rights written in the constitution of Pakistan are now extended to the people of former FATA. Are you aware of these fundamental rights to which under FCR, the people of FATA were not entitle	45.0	41.8	13.2
Article 16 give its citizen the right to assemble, call Jirga, meeting of people to solve the issue at hand. Are you aware that, the Constitution is supporting you in your endeavors to resolve your issues?	31.8	42.3	25.9
Human beings form associations and organizations for the betterment of their security. Article 15 of the constitution of Pakistan provide its citizen this right of formation of association. Are you aware of this?	32.3	40.0	27.7
Article 10 of the constitution of Pakistan slavery and forced labor are prohibited. Are you aware the police and Army in your area have not forced person/persons to do some job forcefully for them?	48.6	39.1	12.3
Are you aware of the right to safeguard against arbitrary arrest and detention provided in Article 10 of the Constitution?	65.5	23.6	10.9
Are you aware that, the concerned authorities should inform the arrested person of the grounds/reasons due to which they have/ are going to arrest detached him (Article 10)?	28.2	60.0	11.8
Are you aware of the avenues and means to adopt if a state institution is indulged in widespread human rights violations?	25.0	63.6	11.4

Knowledge level	Yes	No	Don't know
Do you know that citizen enjoys certain non-violable rights such as the right to life?	23.6	64.5	11.8
Do you know that citizen claims rights over the state?	19.5	70.9	9.5
Do you know that the modern state's only aim is to benefit citizens?	21.4	66.8	11.8
Do you know the state have accepted citizen right to life dignity and inviolability of privacy of home, room, mobile, etc. (Article 14)	15.5	75.0	9.5
Do you know police Army or any other group of individuals violate your right to assemble as described in Article 16 of the constitution?	8.6	80.0	11.4
Do you know the constitution has prohibited discrimination based on gender, language, caste, religion, and province, etc.?	22.7	64.5	12.7
Do you know the state of Pakistan is obliged to provide free and compulsory education to all children of the age of 5 to 16 years?	25.0	65.0	10.0
Do you know the directive principles of the state (Article 29-40) certain additional rights to Pakistan citizens?	30.0	56.4	13.6
Do you know the existence of the United Nations (UN) Human rights Charter 1948?	14.5	74.1	11.4